SOGECLAIR

Revolutionizing Railway Training

Examining the True Benefits of Simulation-Based Training for Railway Drivers

---

A white paper from SOGECLAIR Rail Simulation.

October 2024

Table of Contents

Introduction 1
Effectiveness of Simulation-Based Training 2
Well-Being of Railway Drivers 4
Safety Improvements 5
Cost-Efficiency and ROI 5
Regulatory Compliance and Standardization 6
Challenges and Considerations 7
Conclusion 8
References 9

SOGECLAIR

The Role of Simulation in Railway Driver Training: Enhancing Skills, Safety, and Efficiency.

Introduction

The railway industry, encompassing freight, passenger, and light rail systems, demands rigorous training and preparedness from its operators. Ensuring that drivers, dispatchers, and other critical personnel are equipped with the necessary skills and knowledge is essential to maintain high levels of safety, efficiency, and operational consistency. Simulation-based training (SBT) has become a widely adopted and effective digitally immersive method across various industries to enhance the skills and competencies of drivers.

This white paper explores the advantages of simulation in rail training, focusing on its ability to improve operational effectiveness, enhance safety, reduce costs, comply with regulatory standards, and address future industry challenges. Through an in-depth analysis, this paper explores the:

1) Effectiveness of Simulation-Based Training
    a. How effectively do simulators help trainees acquire and retain the necessary skills?
2) Safety Enhancements Through Simulator Training
    a. Does simulator-based training result in improved safety performance for drivers?
3) Cost Efficiency of Simulator Training
    a. In what ways can simulators reduce the overall costs of training?
    b. What are the potential cost savings when implementing simulators?
4) Standardization in Trainee Assessment
    a. How does simulation-based training impact performance assessments and standardize trainee evaluations?

"In a simulator, you can do things that you can't really do in the real world." -Larry Cathey, Vehicle Platform Manager, Stanford University

Figure 1: SOGECLAIR Rail Simulator at Karlsruhe Stadtbhan

Effectiveness of Simulation-Based Training

The effectiveness of any training program lies in its ability to facilitate skills acquisition and retention. Simulators provide a realistic and interactive learning environment that enhances the development and retention of essential skills for railway drivers.

Skill Development

Numerous studies have demonstrated that simulation-based training significantly contributes to the development and enhancement of essential skills required for railway drivers. A meta-analysis synthesized data from 145 empirical studies of transit systems concluded that simulators are the most effective means to facilitate learning of complex skills. Simulators allow trainees to practice and refine their decision-making abilities, spatial awareness, and reaction times in a realistic yet controlled environment (Chernikova, et al., 2020).

The transferability of these skills to real-world scenarios has been a key factor in the success of simulation-based training programs. A systematic review assessed the effectiveness of driving simulators in improving driver performance and road safety. The review analyzed 17 empirical studies using the PRISMA methodology, which ensures a transparent and standardized process for

literature reviews. The researchers selected studies that specifically evaluated driving simulators as training tools, excluding those that used simulators solely for research on other variables.

The review found that **93.3%** of the studies reported improvements in driver performance following simulator-based training, demonstrating that simulation technologies offer clear advantages for preparing individuals for complex or high-risk scenarios in controlled environments (Alonso, Faus, Riera, Fernandez-Marin, & Useche, 2023).

The interactive nature of simulators, coupled with the ability to repeat more scenarios in less time, allows for a more personalized and adaptive learning experience tailored to individual learning curves. It also grants the ability to be able to train more employees in less time.

Additionally, the immersive nature of simulator training contributes to increased engagement and motivation among learners. This engagement is crucial for fostering a deep understanding of the operational nuances and safety protocols, which are vital aspects of a railway driver's skill set.

A recent study comparing low-fidelity simulation training to traditional real-world methods for train drivers transitioning to the European Rail Traffic Management System (ERTMS) found that drivers who trained using simulators performed significantly better. The simulator group committed 38% fewer driving errors and received 34% higher instructor evaluations than those trained in real-world conditions, as shown in the table. This performance boost is attributed to the ability to repeatedly practice special cases, which are difficult to recreate in real-world scenarios. These findings as showcased in Figure 2, underscore the effectiveness of simulation-based training in preparing drivers for complex and critical tasks, while also highlighting the long-term cost and safety benefits of this approach (Olsson, Lidestam, & Thorslund, 2022).

Driver performance

	Simulator ($n = 8$)		Control ($n = 8$)				
Measurement method	***M***	***SD***	***M***	***SD***	***t***	***p***	***d***
Driving errors (max. 63)	12.63	2.50	20.50	4.69	4.19	**<.01**	2.09
Instructors' evaluation (scale 1–10)	5.97	0.82	3.93	0.71	5.34	**<.01**	2.67

Note: max. = maximum; *M* = mean; *SD* = standard deviation; *t* = Student t-test value; *p* = p-value, probability that the result is a Type 1 error; *d* = effect size measured as Cohen's d.

Bold = significant at the 95% confidence level.

Figure 2: Driver performance comparison between simulator and control group.
Source: Olsson, Lidestam, & Thorslund, 2022.

Cognitive Load and Stress Inoculation

Research has explored how simulation-based training can help individuals manage their cognitive load effectively under stress. Simulators can be programmed to introduce unexpected events, time constraints, and other stressors, allowing individuals to practice maintaining focus and making decisions under pressure. Studies have suggested that exposure to simulated stress can act as a form of "stress inoculation," helping individuals build resilience and coping mechanisms. A study completed in 2008 that was focused on simulation training within aviation showed that “simulated emergencies help individuals improve decision-making under pressure by providing exposure to time-sensitive tasks and unexpected challenges” (Flin, O'Connor, & Crichton, 2008). By gradually

increasing the complexity of scenarios, simulators can adapt to individual learning curves, optimizing the cognitive load for trainees.

“On board these state-of-the-art machines, future drivers encounter the normal and disturbed situations they experience in the field in very realistic conditions.” -Jean-Pierre Farandou, Communications Manager, SNCF Groupe

Real-World Application and Transferability

Research studies have investigated the extent to which skills acquired in simulation settings can be successfully applied in actual railway operations.

A critical aspect is the transferability of skills learned in the simulator to real-world operational scenarios. High-fidelity simulation offers a realistic training environment where the skills learned are highly transferable to real-world rail operations. Furthermore, “There is also encouraging evidence that simulation-based vehicle control training transfers to real-world driving under certain conditions" (Goode, Salmon, & Lenne, 2012). This ensures that operators are prepared for the demands of their roles, reducing the likelihood of errors and improving overall operational performance.

Well-Being of Railway Drivers

Job Satisfaction

The psychological well-being of railway drivers is an important factor that is often overlooked in training discussions. A well-prepared and confident operator is more likely to perform at a higher level, leading to both personal satisfaction and improved job performance.

According to a systematic review, “Simulation technology provides a uniquely valuable tool for organizations by offering opportunities to practice skills in a controlled environment, enhancing confidence and job satisfaction” (Sanchez, Rueda, Kawasaki, Lysebetten, & Diaz, 2023). This has been shown to lead to higher retention rates among railway workers.

Work-Life Balance

The demanding nature of railway operations can impact the work-life balance of drivers. Simulators offer the advantage of flexible training schedules, allowing drivers to engage in skill development without compromising their personal lives. A report by the International Transport Workers Federation (2019), highlights that simulators enable the scheduling of training sessions outside of regular working hours, reducing the burden on drivers and helping them manage their time more effectively.

Safety Improvements

Risk-Free Environment

Simulators offer a risk-free environment for trainees to practice emergency procedures and handle critical situations. By replicating realistic scenarios, simulators allow drivers to learn from their mistakes without any real-world consequences. This aspect is particularly crucial for enhancing safety standards, as drivers can build confidence and competence in managing challenging situations before encountering them on the actual rail network.

Enhanced Emergency Response

Research indicates that simulation-based training improves the emergency response capabilities of railway drivers. Simulators can recreate various emergency scenarios, such as equipment failures, signal malfunctions, or adverse weather conditions. Through repeated practice in a controlled environment, drivers become better equipped to handle emergencies, resulting in quicker response times and increasing the potential to prevent accidents.

An article in Przegląd Elektrotechniczny cited a study that analyzed the impact of simulator training on safety outcomes in railway operations. The study showed that for students whose training included simulators, the speed of reaction and accuracy of operations were better. The results indicated a significant reduction in frequency of errors in emergency situations by 8-12% (Nikitenko & Shvets, 2020). Thus, both the frequency and severity of accidents involving drivers who underwent simulation-based training was reduced compared to those relying solely on traditional methods. The authors attributed this improvement to the enhanced situational awareness and decision-making skills developed through simulator practice.

Cost-Efficiency and ROI

Reduced Operational Costs

Simulation-based training offers a cost-effective solution by reducing the need for in-field training, which often requires taking trains out of service. This can lead to significant operational savings by minimizing the disruption of normal operations and the costs associated with deploying real-world equipment for training purposes. Furthermore, the integration of simulators into training programs also reduces operational costs due to the minimization of wear and tear on the physical equipment.

A recent study conducted on the implementation of simulation-based training, particularly in aviation, demonstrated remarkable cost reductions when compared to traditional training methods using real aircraft. The study introduced several training scenarios, including one in which a significant portion of training is conducted using simulators, resulting in cost reductions of up to 76% compared to methods where real aircraft are used throughout the training process. This savings stems largely from reduced fuel consumption, lower maintenance costs, and a decrease in the wear and tear on physical assets like aircraft (Maciejewska, Kurzawska-Pietrowicz, Galant-Golebiewska, Golebiewski, & Jasinki, 2024).

While outcomes can vary depending on the company and implementation, numerous studies consistently demonstrate that simulation-based training significantly reduces operational costs for organizations across sectors.

Reduced Energy Consumption and Carbon Footprints

Simulators can be used to effectively train drivers to understand and correctly apply traction and regenerative driving modes. It has been shown that through this complex training, drivers were able to reduce energy consumption by up to 4.7% (Nikitenko & Shvets, 2020).

Furthermore, simulator training reduces fleet costs related to fuel consumption, vehicle maintenance, and repairs. For example, a European fleet that implemented eco-drive training, including simulators, reported an average fuel reduction of 2.64% annually, saving 74,225 liters of fuel (Hirsch, 2015).

Cost-Benefit Analysis

While there is an initial investment in simulation technology, the long-term financial benefits are clear. Simulation-based training can deliver long-term financial benefits by reducing operational costs and improving efficiency. Studies have shown that high-quality simulators contribute to fewer accidents, lower fuel consumption, and overall cost savings. Rail companies that adopt simulation-based training can expect to see both immediate and long-term financial benefits.

“When I first started in the simulation space, the sales pitch could be boiled down to – simulation pays for itself within the first accident.” - Drew Carruthers, Product Manager, CM Labs

Regulatory Compliance and Standardization

Regulatory compliance is a paramount concern in the railway industry, and training programs must align with established standards. Simulation-based training provides a standardized approach to education, ensuring that drivers receive consistent and thorough instruction.

Standardized Assessment

The performance can be measured in a wide range of realistic situations that reflect the complexity of the train driver’s task. These situations include degraded and abnormal operational conditions. Furthermore, events can be realized that cannot be reproduced in reality (e.g. equipment failures) and are very rare during daily operation (out-of-course events). Additionally, the events used for

assessment can be reproduced in a repeatable, controllable and consistent way. This allows a standardized and objective assessment as every tested train driver must undergo an identical testing scenario. This is a vital necessity for research but also an advantage for training (Maag & Schmitz, 2012).

As global rail operations move toward more standardized systems like the European Rail Traffic Management System (ERTMS), ensuring compliance with regulatory requirements becomes increasingly important. Simulator-based training offers a structured and controlled environment that allows for consistent training across different regions and operators.

In a recent study comparing simulator-based training with real-world practice, it was noted that "repeated practice in a train-driver simulator environment is, at least from a short perspective, effective" for ensuring drivers are not only proficient but also compliant with the latest regulations. This is particularly important for handling rare or complex scenarios that are critical for regulatory compliance, such as system failures or operational errors (Olsson, Lidestam, & Thorslund, 2022).

Training Standardization

Standardizing training protocols is crucial for maintaining consistent skill levels among railway drivers. Simulators provide a controlled environment where training scenarios can be precisely replicated, ensuring that all trainees have the same experiences. This standardization not only improves the overall quality of training but also contributes to a more uniform and predictable performance from drivers in real-world situations.

In *Simulators for Transportation Human Factors*, Young and Lenné (2017) explain, "The guide to developing and maintaining staff competence (Office of Rail Regulation 2007) presents simulators as a way to infer competencies beyond questioning, assessing activities apportioned with risk and reassessing competence to deal with emergencies and/or infrequent events." This highlights how simulators are integral to ensuring that all personnel are trained to handle both routine and high-risk situations. By enabling standardized assessments of competencies in controlled, yet realistic environments, simulators ensure that railway operators across different locations meet the same high standards for safety and preparedness. This consistency is crucial for regulatory compliance and for maintaining a uniform level of operational safety across the industry.

Challenges and Considerations

Initial Implementation Costs

While simulation-based training offers significant long-term benefits, the initial cost of implementation can be a barrier for some organizations. However, the return on investment in terms of improved safety, efficiency, and reduced operational costs typically outweighs these upfront expenses. Furthermore, multiple studies in aviation simulation-based training have found that the use of simulation-based training provides an ROI of 2x to 3x, which can also be transferred to railway training.

Investing in a $1 million railway simulator can potentially deliver a substantial return on investment (ROI) through anticipated savings on fuel, maintenance, and operational costs. Early case studies and anecdotal reports from companies using rail simulators suggest possible annual savings of around $200,000 by reducing the need for real train assets during training. Additional savings may come from a reduction in accidents and incident-related costs, estimated by some organizations at up to $100,000 annually. Efficiency gains, such as shorter training times and reduced physical infrastructure needs, might further increase savings to approximately $350,000 per year, potentially allowing the simulator to pay for itself in around **2.8 years.**

However, as simulation technology is still relatively new in railway training, long-term data on specific ROI is limited, and these numbers are largely projections based on early adopter case studies and data from other sectors like aviation. Each railway organization's financial outcomes may vary significantly based on their unique needs, usage, and existing infrastructure.

Technology Integration

The effectiveness of simulation-based training relies heavily on the integration of advanced technologies. Ensuring compatibility, regular updates, and technical support are crucial factors that must be addressed to maintain the efficacy of simulators over time. Research in this area focuses on finding sustainable and cost-effective solutions for seamless technology integration.

Conclusion

Simulation-based training for railway drivers has emerged as a critical tool for improving performance, safety, and operational efficiency across the industry. The research explored throughout this paper demonstrates the clear advantages of simulation technology in equipping drivers with the necessary skills to handle real-world challenges. By creating an immersive, controlled environment, simulators allow for the refinement of complex skills, while promoting safe and standardized assessments for trainees.

One of the most significant advantages of simulation is the reduction of operational costs. By minimizing the wear and tear on physical equipment and reducing the need for real-world resources, railway companies can achieve substantial cost savings. This cost-efficiency, combined with the environmental benefits of lower emissions, makes SBT an increasingly attractive option for a sustainable future in the rail industry.

Beyond the technical and operational benefits, simulation training also plays a crucial role in supporting the mental health and well-being of railway drivers. By offering a low-pressure environment where trainees can repeatedly practice and learn from mistakes without real-world consequences, simulation reduces stress and anxiety levels associated with high-stakes, real-time operations. This not only boosts confidence and job satisfaction but also contributes to better long-term mental health outcomes for drivers and enhanced retention of highly trained staff for operators.

Furthermore, the transferability of skills from the simulator to the real-world track has been proven in multiple studies, reinforcing the efficacy of this training method. Beyond just skills, simulation-

based training provides flexibility in scheduling, supports regulatory compliance, and allows for tailored learning experiences that can adapt to different trainee needs.

Overall, simulation-based training represents a forward-thinking approach that addresses not only the technical demands of railway operations but also the broader goals of safety, cost efficiency, and sustainable development. As technology advances, the capabilities of simulators will continue to evolve, offering even greater opportunities for enhancing driver training and performance in the years to come.

References

Alonso, F., Faus, M., Riera, J. V., Fernandez-Marin, M., & Useche, S. A. (2023). Effectiveness of Driving Simulators for Drivers' Training: A Systematic Review. *Automatic Driving Control Method: Latest Advances and Prospects*.

Chernikova, O., Heitzmann, N., Stadler, M., Holzberger, D., Seidel, T., & Fischer, F. (2020). Simulation-Based Learning in Higher Education: A Meta-Analysis. *Review of Educational Research*, 499-541.

Flin, R., O'Connor, P., & Crichton, M. (2008). *Safety at the Sharp End: A Guide to Non-Technical Skills*.

Goode, N., Salmon, P. M., & Lenne, M. G. (2012). Simulation-based driver and vehicle crew training: Aplications, efficacy, and future directions. *Applied Ergonomics*, 435-444.

Hirsch, P. (2015, December 20). *Evidence of Driving Simulator Training Benefits.* Retrieved from Virage Simulation: https://viragesimulation.com/documentation/evidence-driving-simulator-training-benefits/

Maag, C., & Schmitz, M. (2012). *Assessment of Train Drivers' Performance in a Driving Simulator. Rail Human Factors Around the World: Impacts on and of People for Successful Rail Operations. 10.1201/b12742-18*.

Maciejewska, M., Kurzawska-Pietrowicz, P., Galant-Golebiewska, M., Golebiewski, M., & Jasinki, R. (2024). Ecological and Cost Advantage from the Implementation of Flight Simulation Training Devices for Pilot Training. *Applied Sciences*.

Nettleton, A. (2024, April 12). *More than a game: Light rail simulator provides opportunities for operators to hone skills*. Retrieved from RTD-Denver: https://www.rtd-denver.com/community/news/more-than-a-game-light-rail-simulator-provides-opportunities-for-operators-to-hone-skills

Nikitenko, A., & Shvets, A. (2020). *Software and Hardware Simulators for Train Drivers Training: Overview of.* PRZEGLĄD ELEKTROTECHNICZNY.

Olsson, N., Lidestam, B., & Thorslund, B. (2022). Effect of Train-Driving Simulator Practice in the European Rail Traffic Management System: An Experimental Study. *Journal of the Transportation Research Board*.

Sanchez, D. R., Rueda, A., Kawasaki, K., Lysebetten, S. V., & Diaz, D. (2023). Reviewing Simulation Technology: Implications for Workplace Training. *Multimodal Technologies and Interaction*.

Smith, A. (2018, June 28). *IRU Academy - Fuel efficiency training.* Retrieved from International Transport Forum: https://www.itf-oecd.org/

Young, M. S., & Lenne, M. G. (2017). *Simulators for Transportation Human Factors.* CRC Press.

Zahabi, M., Park, J., Abdul Razak , M., & McDonald, A. D. (2019). *Adaptive driving simulation-based training: framework, status, and needs, Theoretical Issues in Ergonomics Science.* DOI: 10.1080/1463922X.2019.1698673.

SOGECLAIR

About SOGECLAIR Rail Simulation

SOGECLAIR Rail Simulation is a provider of FRA compliant high-fidelity rail simulators for training operators in the urban, regional and freight rail markets. At SOGECLAIR Rail Simulation, we empower those responsible for moving people and goods with the skills and readiness to do it faster, more safely and more sustainably.

As a technology company, we recreate the physical world in a high-fidelity digital realm with simulation-based training solutions. Most importantly, we enable drivers and operators in the mobility sectors to perform at their best every day and in every situation.

Around the globe, we support our customers with more than 1,150 employees in approximately 8 sites in 10 countries. SOGECLAIR Rail Simulation represents more than 30 years of technological advancements culminating in the highest-fidelity rail simulators and complete training programs powered by digital technologies. Driven by our comprehensive Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) charter, we embed sustainability in everything we do. Today and tomorrow, we'll make sure our customers are ready to move the world's people and goods faster, more safely and more sustainably.

For more information:

SOGECLAIR Rail Simulation
sogeclair.com
railsim@sogeclair.com